

Mathematical Logic  
Exam  
15 January 2016

- =====
- Verranno valutati solo gli esercizi con soluzione riportata su questi fogli;
  - Rispondete utilizzando una penna a inchiostro (no matite);
  - Scrivete in stampatello, in modo chiaro (risposte illeggibili non saranno considerate);
  - Depennate in modo chiaro il lavoro di brutta copia e le risposte che non volete siano considerate;
- =====

**Exercise 1. [5 marks]**

Say whether the propositions below are valid (VAL), satisfiable but not valid (SAT) or unsatisfiable (UNSAT) in PL:

a.	$\neg(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (A \wedge \neg B)$	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> VAL	<input type="checkbox"/> SAT	<input type="checkbox"/> UNSAT
b.	$(A \wedge B) \wedge \neg B$	<input type="checkbox"/> VAL	<input type="checkbox"/> SAT	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> UNSAT
c.	$(B \rightarrow A) \wedge (\neg A \wedge B)$	<input type="checkbox"/> VAL	<input type="checkbox"/> SAT	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> UNSAT
d.	$((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow A) \rightarrow A$	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> VAL	<input type="checkbox"/> SAT	<input type="checkbox"/> UNSAT
e.	$\neg(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (\neg A \wedge \neg B)$	<input type="checkbox"/> VAL	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> SAT	<input type="checkbox"/> UNSAT

The image shows three handwritten truth tables on a piece of paper. The first table is for exercise a, the second for exercise b, and the third for exercise c. Each table has columns for variables A and B, the sub-expression, and the final result. In the original image, the results for 'VAL' and 'SAT' are circled in red, and 'UNSAT' is circled in black.

A	B	$\neg(A \rightarrow B)$	$\rightarrow$	$(A \wedge \neg B)$
T	T	F	T	F
T	F	T	F	T
F	T	F	T	F
F	F	T	T	F

  

A	B	$(A \wedge B)$	$\wedge$	$\neg B$
T	T	T	F	F
T	F	F	F	T
F	T	F	F	F
F	F	F	F	T

  

A	B	$(B \rightarrow A)$	$\wedge$	$(\neg A \wedge B)$
T	T	T	F	F
T	F	T	F	F
F	T	F	F	T
F	F	T	F	F

A	B	$((A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow A)$			$\rightarrow$	A
T	T	T	T		$\textcircled{T}$	T
T	F	F	T		$\textcircled{T}$	T
F	T	T	F		$\textcircled{T}$	F
F	F	T	F	F	$\textcircled{T}$	F

  

A	B	$\neg(A \wedge B)$	$\rightarrow$	$(\neg A \wedge \neg B)$
T	T	F	$\textcircled{T}$	
T	F	T	$\textcircled{F}$	F
F	T	T	$\textcircled{F}$	F
F	F	T	$\textcircled{T}$	T

**Exercise 2. [4 marks]**

Provide the formal definition of (a) being true in a model and (b) satisfiability for a proposition P in PL

[2 marks] (a) **P is true under v if  $v \models P$ , where  $v \models P$  iff  $v(P) = \text{True}$**  [2 marks]

[2 marks] (b) **P is satisfiable if there is some (at least one) truth valuation v such that  $v \models P$**

**Exercise 3. [2 marks]**

Say whether the following propositions are “true” or “false”.

a) In PL, the interpretation of the symbol $\perp$ has always the same meaning regardless the interpretation function.	<input type="checkbox"/> True <input type="checkbox"/> False
b) In PL, the notation $v \models A$ has to be read “v entails A”.	<input type="checkbox"/> True <input type="checkbox"/> False

**Exercise 4. [4 marks]**

Using the tableaux calculus, determine whether the formula  $\neg A \wedge (C \rightarrow A) \wedge B$  is unsatisfiable. Mark each branch as open or closed. Motivate the answer.

**Convert the formula in CNF.**

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \neg A \wedge (\neg C \vee A) \wedge B \\
 | \\
 \neg A \\
 | \\
 (\neg C \vee A) \wedge B \\
 | \\
 (\neg C \vee A) \\
 | \\
 B \\
 / \quad \backslash \\
 \neg C \quad A
 \end{array}$$

Since the first branch is open then it is satisfiable.

**Exercise 5. [4 marks]**

Provide the steps and the output of the DPLL algorithm (by assuming a version WITHOUT the pure literal step) for the PL formula  $(C \rightarrow A) \wedge (C \rightarrow B) \wedge \neg(A \wedge B)$  and say if the formula is satisfiable or not.

**Convert the formula in CNF. By implication elimination we obtain the formula:  $(\neg C \vee A) \wedge (\neg C \vee B) \wedge (\neg A \vee \neg B)$**

**As we do not have unit clauses, we need to go for the branching literal step.**

**Let us choose C and first call DPLL for:  $(\neg C \vee A) \wedge (\neg C \vee B) \wedge (\neg A \vee \neg B) \wedge C$**

**By assigning  $v(C) = T$ , by propagation we obtain:  $A \wedge B \wedge (\neg A \vee \neg B)$**

**With the branching on A we can choose to call DPLL on:  $A \wedge B \wedge (\neg A \vee \neg B) \wedge A$**

**By assigning  $v(A) = T$ , by propagation we obtain:  $B \wedge \neg B$  that is clearly inconsistent.**

**Check for the other branch  $(\neg C \vee A) \wedge (\neg C \vee B) \wedge (\neg A \vee \neg B) \wedge \neg C$**

**By assigning  $v(C) = F$ , by propagation we obtain  $(\neg A \vee \neg B)$**

**We need to go for the branching literal step again:**

**Let us choose C and first call DPLL for:  $\neg A \wedge (\neg A \vee \neg B)$**

**By assigning  $v(A) = F$ , by propagation we obtain that the formula is satisfiable.**

**Exercise 6. [2 marks]**

Provide the formal definition of *interpretation over an assignment* in FOL

$$\begin{array}{ll}
 I_a(c) = I(c) & \text{for each constant } c \\
 I_a(x) = a(x) & \text{for each variable } x \\
 I_a(f^n(t_1, \dots, t_n)) = I(f^n)(I_a(t_1), \dots, I_a(t_n)) & \text{for each function } f \text{ of arity } n
 \end{array}$$

**Exercise 7. [4 marks] – FOL formalization**

Given the following language:

Constants: A, B, C, D, E, F;

Predicates: On<sup>2</sup>, Above<sup>2</sup>, Free<sup>1</sup>, Red<sup>1</sup>, Green<sup>1</sup>.

Translate in FOL the following natural language sentences:

**[1 mark] Everything that is free has nothing on it**

$\phi_1 : \forall x.(\text{Free}(x) \rightarrow \neg \exists y. \text{On}(y, x))$

**[1 mark] Everything that is green is free**

$\phi_2 : \forall x.(\text{Green}(x) \rightarrow \text{Free}(x))$

**[1 mark] There is something that is red and is not free**

$\phi_3 : \exists x.(\text{Red}(x) \wedge \neg \text{Free}(x))$

**[1 mark] Everything that is not green and is above B, is red**

$\phi_4 : \forall x.(\neg \text{Green}(x) \wedge \text{Above}(x, B) \rightarrow \text{Red}(x))$

**Exercise 8. [4 marks] – FOL interpretation/semantics**

Given the language provided in the previous exercise and given the following interpretation:

- $I_1(A) = \text{hat}, I_1(B) = \text{Joe}, I_1(C) = \text{bike}, I_1(D) = \text{Jill}, I_1(E) = \text{case}, I_1(F) = \text{ground};$
- $I_1(\text{On}) = \{ \langle \text{hat}, \text{Joe} \rangle, \langle \text{Joe}, \text{bike} \rangle, \langle \text{bike}, \text{ground} \rangle, \langle \text{Jill}, \text{case} \rangle, \langle \text{case}, \text{ground} \rangle \}$
- $I_1(\text{Above}) = \{ \langle \text{hat}, \text{Joe} \rangle, \langle \text{hat}, \text{bike} \rangle, \langle \text{hat}, \text{ground} \rangle, \langle \text{Joe}, \text{bike} \rangle, \langle \text{Joe}, \text{ground} \rangle, \langle \text{bike}, \text{ground} \rangle, \langle \text{Jill}, \text{case} \rangle, \langle \text{Jill}, \text{ground} \rangle, \langle \text{case}, \text{ground} \rangle \}$
- $I_1(\text{Free}) = \{ \langle \text{hat} \rangle, \langle \text{Jill} \rangle \}, I_1(\text{Green}) = \{ \langle \text{hat} \rangle, \langle \text{ground} \rangle \}, I_1(\text{Red}) = \{ \langle \text{bike} \rangle, \langle \text{case} \rangle \}$

For each formula in Exercise 7, check whether it is satisfied by the interpretation  $I_1$ .

$\phi_1$	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
$\phi_2$	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
$\phi_3$	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no
$\phi_4$	<input type="checkbox"/> yes	<input type="checkbox"/> no

**Exercise 9. [4 marks] – Modal logic**

Given the Kripke model  $M = \langle W, R, I \rangle$  with:  $W = \{1, 2, 3\}$ ,  $R = \{ \langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 2, 1 \rangle, \langle 1, 3 \rangle, \langle 3, 3 \rangle \}$ ,  $I(A) = \{1, 2\}$  and  $I(B) = \{2, 3\}$

- [2 marks]** Say whether the frame  $\langle W, R \rangle$  is serial, reflexive, symmetric or transitive.  
**It is serial.**
- [2 marks]** Is  $M, 1 \models \diamond(A \wedge B)$ ? Provide a proof for your response.  
**Yes, because  $A \wedge B$  is true in 2 and 2 is accessible from 1.**